

**cymdeithas<sup>o</sup>**  
yr iaith  
gymraeg

# **S4C a'r Dyfodol**

**Ymateb  
Cymdeithas yr  
Iaith i ymchwiliad  
gan y Pwyllgor  
Materion Cymreig**



**Ionawr 2011**

# Ymchwiliad S4C y Pwyllgor Materion Cymreig

## Ymateb Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg

### 1. Rhagair

1.1 Daeth S4C i fodolaeth yn sgil ymgyrch boblogaidd hir a thrwy gonsensws gwleidyddol. Bu'r frwydr i sefydlu'r Sianel yn hir a chostus: llwyddodd y Gymdeithas a'i chefnogwyr i sefydlu'r achos yn y lle cyntaf dros yr angen am sianel ar wahân ar gyfer rhaglenni Cymraeg, a chreu consensws eang yng Nghymru o blaid yr achos hwnnw. Carcharwyd nifer o aelodau'r Gymdeithas - am rychwant o gyfnodau o ychydig ddyddiau hyd at 2 neu 3 blynedd, a bu'r gost yn ddrud iawn i nifer. Yn y cyd-destun hanesyddol hynny gosodwyd fformiwla ariannu S4C mewn statud; er mwyn sicrhau na fyddai ymyrraeth wleidyddol yn y dull y'i hariennir.

1.2 Mae Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg wedi cyhoeddi llyfryn S4C: Pwy dalodd amdani? yn olrhain hanes yr ymgyrch dorfol a gallwch ei darllen ar-lein: <http://cymdeithas.org/pdf/s4c-pwy-dalodd-amdani.pdf>

1.3 Mae S4C yn fuddsoddiad unigryw yn yr iaith Gymraeg ac yn gonglfaen i'r diwylliant Cymraeg, gan chwarae rhan allweddol yn hybu yr iaith Gymraeg. Yn ol y Cenhedloedd Unedig, mae'r iaith Gymraeg yn parhau i fod yn iaith o dan fygythiad (Atlas UNESCO leithoedd o Dan Fygythiad 2009) ac felly, mae angen camau arbennig i'w diogelu ar gyfer y dyfodol. Mae'r Deyrnas Unedig hefyd wedi llofnodi'r Siartr Ewropeaidd ar leithoedd Lleiafrifol a Rhanbarthol sy'n nodi dan Erthygl 11 y dylid darparu cyfryngau yn yr ieithoedd rhanbarthol gan barchu annibyniaeth ac ymreolaeth y cyfryngau.

1.4 Mae miloedd o sianeli erbyn hyn ar ein sgriniau ac mae'n bwysig iawn i ni fedru cael y sicrwydd o weld a chlywed y Gymraeg ar S4C. Un o'r prif resymau dros ymgyrchu am sianel Gymraeg yn y saithdegau oedd i'r Gymraeg ymestyn i gyfryngau newydd ac nad oedd yn cael ei weld fel iaith hen ffasiwn, ac mae S4C wedi bod rhan mawr o'r newid meddylfryd yna a rhoi hyder newydd yn nyfodol y Gymraeg. Mae addysg Gymraeg ar gynnydd yng Nghymru a hyn yn cael ei gefnogi yn fawr gan y S4C gyda rhaglenni i blant o'r crud gan ddechrau gyda Cyw, Planed Plant, ac yn ddiweddar, Stwnsh.

1.5 Pryderwn fod y gostyngiad yng nghyllideb S4C yn mynd i effeithio ar safon y rhaglenni a ddarperir. Rhaid cael arian teg er mwyn cynnal a datblygu yr amrywiaeth o raglenni sydd ar gael: dramâu fel Pen Talar a Teulu, digwyddiadau byw fel yr Eisteddfod Genedlaethol a'r Sioe Frenhinol a chwaraeon. Heb arian digonol, ni fydd y sianel yn gallu cystadlu â sianeli prif-ffrwd eraill o ran safon a chreadigrwydd. Wrth dorri arian S4C, rydych nid yn unig yn dirywio'r gwasanaeth ond yn ergyd uniongyrchol i'r iaith Gymraeg a fydd mewn sefyllfa bregus heb gyllideb gyflawn.

1.6 Mewn nifer o ffyrdd mae cynlluniau Llywodraeth y DG bresennol yn tanseilio yr ymdrechion trawsbleidiol a fu i roi lle priodol i'r iaith Gymraeg yn y cyfryngau. Yn y cyfryngau yn gyffredinol, mae'r iaith Gymraeg yn wynebu talcen caled, gyda dirywiad eithafol yn narpariaeth yn y Gymraeg ar orsafoedd radio masnachol megis Heart FM a Radio Ceredigion.

1.7 Ystyriwn y toriadau i S4C fel gwahaniaethu yn erbyn grŵp ieithyddol lleiafrifol. Condemniwn y toriadau yn gyffredinol, ond rhaid i Llywodraeth Llundain ddeall fod y toriadau hyn yn mynd i gael effaith uniongyrchol ar yr iaith Gymraeg. Enghraifft prin yw S4C o fuddsoddiad economaidd sydd wedi ei wneud drwy gyfrwng yr iaith Gymraeg. Mae hyn wedi hybu'r iaith Gymraeg yn y lleoliadau lle bu S4C yn buddsoddi. Credwn y bydd y toriadau'n gyffredinol yn cael effaith ar yr iaith Gymraeg oherwydd y sgil-ffeithiau mewn cymunedau iaith Gymraeg.

1.8 Bydd cynlluniau eraill Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol yn effeithio ar yr iaith Gymraeg oherwydd ei bod yn ddibynnol ar gymunedau lle y'i siaredir; bydd y polisi o annog pobl i symud i ffwrdd o'u cymunedau i chwilio am waith yn gwaethygu allfudiad pobl ifanc o'u cymunedau ac yn golygu dirywiad yr iaith Gymraeg yn y cymunedau hynny. Mae'n hanfodol bwysig felly i warchod buddsoddiad economi sy'n digwydd trwy gyfrwng yr iaith Gymraeg.

1.9 Mae presenoldeb y Gymraeg yn y cyfryngau yn hollbwysig i bawb yng Nghymru. Cred Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg yw bod gan bawb yng Nghymru, boed yn siaradwyr Cymraeg neu beidio, hawliau i'r Gymraeg. Hynny yw, nid yn unig hawliau i'w defnyddio a'i dysgu, ond hefyd i'w gwrando a'i gweld. Felly, mae presenoldeb yr iaith ar y teledu, radio, y we a phob cyfrwng arall yn allweddol i'n gweledigaeth ni fel mudiad. Nid yw'r weledigaeth hon yn gyfyngedig i Gymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg yn unig. Bydd prif nod y Comisiynydd Iaith newydd sydd ar fin cael ei sefydlu gan Lywodraeth Cymru yn cynnwys nod "i'r egwyddor y dylai personau yng Nghymru allu byw eu bywydau drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg os ydynt yn dymuno gwneud hynny." Nod sy'n adlweyrchu uchelgais ag amlinellwyd yn nogfen Iaith Pawb yn 2003 sef bod 'pawb ledled Cymru yn gallu defnyddio'r Gymraeg yn ystod eu bywydau cymdeithasol, eu horiau hamdden a'u gweithgareddau busnes'.

## 2. Na i doriadau

2.1 Mae'r Gymdeithas yn erbyn toriadau'r Llywodraeth yn gyffredinol: nid yw'n gyfiawn i ddisgwyl i leiafrifoedd, y tlawd, a phobl ar yr ymylon i dalu am gamgymeriadau y sector ariannol a'r llywodraethau oedd yn ei gwasanaethau. Er mai diffyg rheoleiddio'r farchnad rydd oedd wrth wraidd y dirwasgiad, yn groes i synnwyr cyffredin, mae'r Llywodraeth y DG yn ymateb i'r argyfwng wrth dorri ymhellach ar amddiffynfeydd y gwan yn wyneb tueddiadau cyfalafol.

2.2 Fel dywedodd Gweinidog Diwylliant Llywodraeth Catalonia mewn tystiolaeth diweddar o flaen y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

*"nid yw rhyddfrydiaeth ieithyddol, fel rhyddfrydiaeth economaidd, yn amhleidiol... pan fydd dwy iaith yn cyd-fodoli mewn un gwlad, mae galw am weithredu cyhoeddus i amddiffyn yr un gwannach. Fel arall, fe'i gwthir, yn y lle cyntaf, i'r cyrion ac, yn y tymor hir, i ddifodiant."*

2.3 Methiant y farchnad yw un o'r rhesymau sefydlwyd S4C yn y lle gyntaf. Cyn bodolaeth ein hunig sianel teledu Cymraeg, bu rhaid i raglenni Cymraeg cystadlu gyda rhaglenni Saesneg am arian a lle yn yr amserlen. Un o nifer fawr iawn o broblemau gyda chyd-gynllun Llywodraeth y DG - BBC ydy ail-greu'r un hen gystadleuaeth rhwng rhaglenni Cymraeg a Saesneg. Bydd hyn yn creu tyndra cystadleuol rhwng y ddwy iaith, rhywbeth sy'n gwrth-ddweud y neges o ddwyieithrwydd cyfartal sydd wedi datblygu yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, ac felly yn gam enfawr yn ôl.

2.4 Rydym yn ymwybodol o gynllun y Llywodraeth i gwtogi ar gyllideb y sianel o 24.4%, neu 42.5% mewn termau real (ffynhonnell: BECTU), ffigur yr oedd awdurdod y sianel yn darogan a allai beryglu bodolaeth y sianel. Ond yn ogystal a'r cwtogiadau, mae'r Llywodraeth yn rhoi cyfrifoldeb rheoli ac ariannu'r sianel yn rhannol ar y BBC.

2.5 Mae rhai yn dadlau y byddai'n bosib gwarantu annibyniaeth S4C o fewn cyfundrefn cyd-reolaeth y BBC. Nid ydym yn cytuno â hyn. Gwelwn yn glir wendidau y cynllun rhwng y BBC a Llywodraeth y DG wrth edrych ar sefyllfa ddarlledu cyfrwng Saesneg yng Nghymru. Am flynyddoedd, bu torri yn ôl ar allbwn Cymreig ei natur gan y BBC, sef rhaglenni sy'n adlweyrchu bywyd yng Nghymru ar y teledu. Nid ydynt yn gallu dibynnu ar y BBC i ddiogelu rhaglenni Cymreig yn y Saesneg, felly pam y dylen ni ddisgwyl iddynt ddiogelu rhaglenni Cymraeg? Mae sefyllfa darlledu yng Nghymru yn

argyfyngus eisoes, mae'r cynlluniau newydd yn mynd i ladd unrhyw obaith am blwraliaeth o fewn y cyfryngau yng Nghymru.

2.6 Sefydlwyd y sianel ar ol etholiad 1979 gyda ymrwymiad i sefydlu'r sianel ym maniffesto pob un o'r pedair prif blaid yng Nghymru. Heddiw, nid oedd sôn am gynlluniau i gwtogi yn eithafol ar gyllideb y sianel, cyd-reolaeth o dan ymddiriedolaeth BBC, na chyflwyno deddf gwlad a fyddai caniatáu i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ddiddymu'r sianel yn llwyr ym maniffesto unrhyw blaid.

### **3. S4C Newydd**

3.1 Rydym yn cydnabod bod gwendidau ym model a rheolaeth presennol S4C, galwn felly am S4C newydd, sef darlledwr/cyhoeddwr Cymraeg aml-gyfryngol, datganoledig i Gymru.

3.2 Rydym yn galw am S4C newydd yn seiliedig ar yr egwyddorion canlynol:

- **SICRWYDD ARIANNOL** - Ni ellir rhedeg sianel deledu heb sicrwydd ynglyn â chyllid digonol. Mae'r cytundeb presennol yn rhoi arian pendant i S4C hyd at 2015. Credwn bod angen fformiwla ariannol i S4C fydd yn rhoi sefydlogrwydd hir dymor iddi wneud ei gwaith yn hyderus.
- **ANNIBYNIAETH** - Mae annibyniaeth gwasanaethau cyfryngau cyhoeddus Cymraeg yn hanfodol er mwyn sicrhau plwraliaeth gyfryngol a democrataidd. Rhaid i Awdurdod S4C ac S4C fod yn annibynnol o'r BBC ac eraill yn olygyddol, strategaethol a chreadigol.
- **DATGANOLI** - Mae'n hanfodol, er mwyn sicrhau bod yr arbenigedd a'r gallu i wneud y penderfyniadau cywir dros ddyfodol darlledu yng Nghymru, bod grymoedd deddfu dros y cyfryngau yn cael eu trosglwyddo i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru.
- **BBC FFEDERAL** - Mae'n hanfodol bod datganoli grym yn digwydd o fewn y BBC gyda system ffederal fel y dewis gorau, er mwyn sicrhau tegwch a chydbwysedd.
- **SAFON** - Mae cyfryngau Cymraeg sydd o safon gyfatebol i'r cyfryngau a geir yn yr iaith Saesneg yn hanfodol i barhad yr iaith Gymraeg.
- **DIGIDOL** - Mae creu ecosystem gyfryngol amrywiol yn hanfodol i ddyfodol y Gymraeg. Mae buddsoddiad sylweddol mewn cyfryngau digidol yn hollbwysig er mwyn sicrhau bod y Gymraeg yn briod iaith pob cyfrwng.
- **CYDWEITHIO** - Mae cydweithrediad rhwng sefydliadau cyfryngol a thu hwnt yn hanfodol er mwyn galluogi ein cyfryngau i fod mor gryf â phosib, ond cydweithio nad yw'n peryglu annibyniaeth y darparwr Cymraeg.
- **DATGANOLI'R SIANEL O GWMPAS CYMRU** - Credwn fod pencadlys presennol S4C yn Llanisien yn anaddas ar gyfer y cyfryngau yng Nghymru ac y dylid datganoli rhannau gwahanol o'r broses o redeg gwasanaeth cyfryngau Cymraeg cyhoeddus.

3.3 Rydym yn gryf o'r farn fod angen adolygiad llwyr o strwythur comisiynu, strategaeth a rôl Awdurdod S4C, gan gynnwys modelau amgen ar gyfer Awdurdod S4C a gweinyddu gwariant ar gyfryngau Cymraeg. Cydnabyddwn fod diffyg atebolrwydd wedi bod rhwng S4C â'i chynulleidfa yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf ond nid drwy bartneriaethau â'r BBC y mae gwneud hynny.

3.4 Rydym yn awyddus iawn i weld S4C yn ymestyn ei gylch gorchwyl i gynnwys y cyfryngau digidol, fel ei fod yn gyhoeddwr cyfryngau yn hytrach na bod yn gyfyngedig i sianel deledu yn unig. Credwn fod angen hybu'r Gymraeg fel cyfrwng yn y meysydd hyn fel a nodwyd yn yr adroddiad diwethaf gan Bwyllgor Siarter Ieithoedd Rhanbarthol neu Leiafrifol Cyngor Ewrop wrth ystyried y ddarpariaeth o gyfryngau Cymraeg. Mae angen ystyried newid y berthynas Awdurdod / Sianel i un allai roi'r hyblygrwydd i Awdurdod S4C ymestyn ei faes gorchwyl i gynnwys cyfryngau digidol.

3.5 Dylid dynodi canran sylweddol o fformiwla ariannu Awdurdod S4C i'w fuddsoddi mewn cyfryngau digidol er mwyn adeiladu cynulleidfara'r dyfodol, gan sicrhau bod teledu llinellol yn parhau'n gryf. Dylid penodi cyfarwyddwr digidol er mwyn datblygu hyn.

3.6 Credwn y dylid ystyried rhannu cyfrifoldebau S4C rhwng tair canolfan ar draws Cymru, gan weinyddu adrannau mewn lleoliadau amrywiol hytrach na thaeu swyddi yn denau. Byddai'n help pe bae gweinyddiaeth ganolog S4C yn agosach i'r cwmnïau annibynnol sy'n cael eu comisiynu i greu rhaglenni iddynt.

## **4. Y Mesur Cyrff Cyhoeddus**

4.1 Rydym yn cytuno gyda nifer o sylwadau diweddar yn Nhŷ'r Arglwyddi am y Mesur Cyrff Cyhoeddus ac yn cytuno gyda gwelliannau Roger Roberts a fyddai'n eithrio S4C o'r Mesur.

4.2 Mae'r Mesur yn ceisio ymdrin â S4C yn yr un modd ag adrannau eraill y Llywodraeth. Camsyniad cyfreithiol, ariannol a hanesyddol yw delio â darlledu Cymraeg fel yn y ffordd hyn.

4.3 Nid yw'n addas, nac yn adlewyrchu'r modd a sefydlwyd y sianel ychwaith, i wthio cynlluniau am S4C trwy'r Mesur Cyrff Cyhoeddus.

4.4 Yn gyntaf, ni ddylid gadael i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol trwy is-ddeddfwriaeth benderfynu ar strwythur, cyllideb a bodolaeth y sianel a sefydlwyd mewn deddf am resymau cymdeithasol a diwylliannol pwysig tu hwnt.

4.5 Cytunwn gyda chasgliadau pwyllgor cyfansoddiadol Tŷ'r Arglwyddi a feirniadodd yn hallt y syniad y dylid gwaredu a chyrrff mewn is-ddeddfwriaeth.

4.6 Yn ail, perygl iawn yw gosod y cynsail y dylai fod gan y Llywodraeth yn unig, hawl i benderfynu ar gyllideb sianel teledu gyhoeddus yn flynyddol. Byddai penderfyniad o'r fath yn codi cwestiynau difrifol am annibyniaeth wleidyddol y darlledwr.

4.7 Yn drydydd, amhosib yw deall pam bo'r llywodraeth am ddatgan nawr eu bod am ddiwygio cyllideb y sianel a sicrhau partneriaeth rhwng S4C a'r BBC. Ar yr un pryd maent wedi penderfynu cynnwys y sianel yn atodlen 7 y Mesur. Trwy wneud hyn, mae'r Llywodraeth yn caniatáu i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol i godi ffi am wasanaeth S4C, preifateiddio'r gwasanaeth neu ei diddymu'n llwyr.

4.8 Oni fyddai'n well ystyried dyfodol ac annibyniaeth S4C yn y ddeddf ddarlledu nesaf o fewn y blynyddoedd nesaf? Gan fod gymaint o faterion fel annibyniaeth y sianel yn ogystal ag ystyriaethau ehangach fel effaith ar yr iaith Gymraeg a phlwrailiaeth y cyfryngau yng Nghymru, byddai'n ddoethach ystyried dyfodol S4C mewn amserlen sy'n ganiatáu i bobl yng Nghymru gael rhoi eu mewnbwn i ddyfodol y sianel yn hytrach na penderfyniadau brys gan Weinidogion yn y Llywodraeth a Phenathiaid y BBC.

## **5. Cyd-reolaeth y BBC**

5.1 Mae'r penderfyniad i symud cyllideb a rhan o reolaeth S4C i'r BBC hefyd yn tansellio annibyniaeth y sianel, ac yn y pen draw mae'n fygythiad pellach i lefel yr ariannu ar gyfer rhaglenni a deunydd Cymraeg. Ofnwn y byddwn yn mynd yn ôl i sefyllfa cyn pasio deddf S4C, lle bydd yn rhaid i raglenni iaith Gymraeg gystadlu am arian â rhaglenni iaith Saesneg. Ofnwn na fydd gan S4C yr

annibyniaeth olygyddol ddigonol chwaith er mwyn gwneud penderfyniadau sydd orau ar gyfer y sianel Gymraeg. Yn ogystal, mi fydd yn creu achosion o wrthdaro buddiannau yn arbennig felly lle mae S4C yn cynhyrchu deunydd Cymraeg allai fod yn debyg i ddeunydd Saesneg. Mae S4C yn cystadlu gyda'r BBC am gynulleidfa a thalent mewn rhai achosion - pwy fyddai'n cael y gair olaf mewn achosion fel hyn pe nad oes gan S4C annibyniaeth i gymeryd penderfyniadau rheoli heb sêl bendith y BBC. Ni fyddai'n deg o gwbl pe bae bwrdd gweithredol S4C yn gyfuniad o awdurdod S4C a chynrychiolwyr o'r BBC. Ni fyddai'r BBC yn derbyn ar unrhyw delerau i'r Llywodraeth gael cynrychiolaeth ar yr ymddiriedolaeth, felly nid yw'r deg gofyn i S4C gael ei reoli mewn unrhyw ffordd sy'n gyd-reolaeth â'r BBC.

5.2 Mae'r diffyg annibyniaeth a warantir gan gynlluniau'r llywodraeth yn glir o lythyr Michael Lyons at awdurdod S4C. Dywed y llythyr taw "Ymddiriedolaeth y BBC yw gwarcheidwad ffi'r drwydded ac o ganlyniad bydd angen iddi gael tros olwg o'r ffordd y mae'r arian hwn yn cael ei wario." Mewn termau eraill, penderfyniad y BBC ar lefel Prydeinig fydd faint o arian gaiff ei wario, sut caiff ei wario a phwy gaiff wneud y gwario ar ddarledu Cymraeg.

5.3 Cytunwn a sylwadau Elystan Morgan (9 Tach. 2010 : Colofn 140-1, Hansard):

*"A legislative framework was set up that guaranteed funds for [S4C] that would be adequate for it to carry out its commission. Indeed, its independence was guaranteed by statute. The viability of that channel is now challenged and jeopardised by the fact that that financial guarantee disappears. The independence is jeopardised by the fact that it is contemplated that it should be merged with the BBC as a very junior, meagre partner. Its independence cannot possibly be real in those circumstances; indeed, the major decisions may well be taken by the broadcasting trust in London. I do not believe that I overstate for a moment the anxieties that are felt in Wales concerning that loss of independence. ... The continued viability and independence of S4C is crucial to the very existence of the Welsh language. The Welsh language is spoken by some 580,000 persons, including three or four of us in this House. It is one of the oldest living languages in Europe-it stems back to its Indo-European origins about 1,500 years ago. It was a living language 1,000 years ago, when French was only a patois of Latin. In those circumstances, I ask the House to consider that it is part of its trust in relation to the Welsh language to regard the situation of S4C as being wholly unique. Parliament has the sovereignty to amend all the legislative structures but, in so doing, it would be reneging on the solemn compact that was made between a very honourable gentleman and the people of Wales 28 years ago."*

5.4 I sicrhau'r dyfodol gorau a mwyaf teg i'r sianel Gymraeg, galwn ar y Llywodraeth i sicrhau'r canlynol:

- Annibyniaeth rheolaeth ac annibyniaeth olygyddol Iwyr i S4C heb ymyrraeth oddi wrth y BBC na'r Llywodraeth;
- Fformiwla gyllido annibynnol ar gyfer y sianel Gymraeg, ar sail chwyddiant.

## 6. Diweddsglo

6.1 Mae'r sianel Gymraeg yn cael ei drysori gan bobl yng Nghymru oherwydd ei fod yn gyfrwng sy'n dod â'r Gymraeg yn fyw i bobl sy'n siarad Cymraeg, i bobl nad ydynt yn siarad Cymraeg, i ddysgwyr, i fabanod, plant, bobl ifanc a henoed ym mhob rhan o Gymru. Mae'r iaith Gymraeg yn perthyn i bawb yng Nghymru, os ydynt yn siarad y Gymraeg ai peidio. Pwrpas S4C yw darparu rhaglenni yn yr iaith Gymraeg. Dyna pam y cafodd ei sefydlu ar ôl blynyddoedd o brotestio ac ymgyrchu, yr unig sianel i gael ei chreu o ganlyniad i ymgyrch dorfol o'r fath.

6.2 Yng Nghymru, rydym yn byw ein bywydau mewn dwy iaith. Mae angen gwasanaeth teledu Cymraeg a gwasanaeth teledu yn y Saesneg i gynrychioli Cymru. Nid oes angen aberthu'r sianel Gymraeg er mwyn cael mwy o deledu Saesneg yng Nghymru fel mae rhai yn mynnu. Dyletswydd Aelodau Seneddol o Gymru yw i sicrhau cynllun darlledu teg ar gyfer pawb sy'n byw yng Nghymru.

6.3 Mae'n hanfodol i S4C gael fformiwla gyllido ddigonol ac i fod yn annibynnol o'r BBC. Mae Llywodraeth y Ceidwadwyr a'r Democratiaid yn dangos diffyg parch tuag at bobl Cymru o ran darlledu yn benodol ac wedi tanseilio datganoli ar y mater hwn. Mae angen plwraliaeth yn ein cyfryngau a'r maes cyfryngau, ac i'r cyfryngau iaith Gymraeg a Saesneg siarad i Gymru gyfan.

## Atodiadau:

1. Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg S4C: Pwy Dalodd Amdani? (Argraffiad Cyntaf: 1985, Ail-argraffiad: 2010): <http://cymdeithas.org/pdf/s4c-pwy-dalodd-amdani.pdf>

2. Cynnig Brys S4C - Cafodd ei basio yng Nghyfarfod Cyffredinol y Gymdeithas Hydref 2010

Noda'r Cyfarfod Cyffredinol y canlynol:

- Daeth S4C i fodolaeth yn sgil ymgyrch boblogaidd hir a thrwy gonsensws gwleidyddol.
- Gosodwyd fformiwla ariannu S4C mewn statud er mwyn sicrhau na fyddai ymyrraeth wleidyddol yn y dull y'i hariennir.
- Mae lefel ariannu S4C yn adlewyrchu'r angen i sicrhau bod gwasanaeth Cymraeg yn gyfatebol a gwasanaethau prif-ffrwd ar sianeli eraill o ran safon a chreadigrwydd.
- Mae S4C yn unigryw, yn gonglfaen i'r diwylliant Cymraeg, ac yn hyn o beth yn wasanaeth na ellir ei drin yn yr un modd ag 'adrannau' llywodraethol eraill.
- Mae'r grym i benderfynu ar natur y cyfryngau yn parhau gyda Llywodraeth y DU a'r BBC.

Cred y Cyfarfod Cyffredinol:

- Mae'n hanfodol, er mwyn sicrhau bod yr arbenigedd a'r gallu i wneud y penderfyniadau cywir dros ddyfodol darlledu yng Nghymru, bod grymoedd deddfu dros y cyfryngau yn cael eu trosglwyddo i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru.
- Mae'n hanfodol bod datganoli grym yn digwydd o fewn y BBC gyda system ffederal fel y dewis gorau, er mwyn sicrhau tegwch a chydbwysedd,
- Mae cyfryngau Cymraeg sydd o safon gyfatebol i'r cyfryngau a geir yn yr iaith Saesneg yn hanfodol i barhad yr iaith Gymraeg
- Mae creu ecosystem gyfryngol amrywiol yn hanfodol i ddyfodol y Gymraeg. Mae buddsoddiad sylweddol mewn cyfryngau digidol yn hollbwysig er mwyn sicrhau bod y Gymraeg yn briod iaith pob cyfrwng.
- Mae cydweithrediad rhwng sefydliadau cyfryngol a thu hwnt yn hanfodol er mwyn galluogi ein cyfryngau i fod mor gryf â phosib.
- Mae annibyniaeth gwasanaethau cyfryngau cyhoeddus Cymraeg yn hanfodol er mwyn sicrhau plwraliaeth gyfryngol a democrataidd. Ni ddylid ystyried ar unrhyw amod i swyddogaethau S4C ddod o dan adain y BBC.
- Credwn fod pencadlys presennol S4C yn Llanisien yn anaddas ar gyfer y cyfryngau yng Nghymru ac y dylid datganoli rhannau gwahanol o'r broses o redeg gwasanaeth cyfryngau Cymraeg cyhoeddus.

Galwa'r Cyfarfod Cyffredinol am:

- Datganoli grym dros ddarledu Cymreig i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru.
- Adolygiad llwyr o strwythur comisiynu, strategaeth a rôl Awdurdod S4C, gan gynnwys modelau amgen ar gyfer Awdurdod S4C a gweinyddu gwariant ar gyfryngau Cymraeg.
- Ystyriaeth am newid y berthynas Awdurdod / Sianel i un allai roi'r hyblygrwydd i Awdurdod S4C ymestyn ei faes gorchwyl i gynnwys cyfryngau digidol a chyfryngau eraill tu hwnt i deledu.
- Sicrhau bod canran sylweddol o fformiwla ariannu Awdurdod S4C yn cael ei fuddsoddi mewn cyfryngau digidol er mwyn adeiladu cynulleidfa y dyfodol, gan sicrhau bod teledu llinellol yn parhau yn gryf. Dylid penodi cyfarwyddwr digidol er mwyn datblygu hyn.
- Rhoi fformiwla ariannu teg ar gyfer S4C fydd yn rhoi sicrwydd ar gyfer ei dyfodol hir-dymor a sicrhau ei fod yn gorff tu hwnt i ymyrraeth wleidyddol
- Datganoli gwaith S4C rhwng tair canolfan ar draws Cymru, gan redeg adrannau gwahanol ohonynt yn hytrach na thaeu swyddi yn denau.

Ymhellach galwa'r Cyfarfod Cyffredinol ar:

- Aelodau Seneddol - ac yn benodol Aelodau Seneddol Cymru - i bleidleisio yn erbyn y cymalau hynny o'r mesur Cyrff Cyhoeddus a fydd yn caniatáu i'r llywodraeth roi ei newidiadau arfaethedig ar waith.
- aelodau a chefnogwyr Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg i weithredu ar frys i bwysu ar eu Aelodau Seneddol lleol i'r perwyl hwn
- y Trefnydd Ymgyrchu ar y We newydd i ddatblygu adran amlwg ar wefan y Gymdeithas er mwyn hybu a hwyluso ymgyrch lobio o'r fath.

Yn olaf er mwyn adlewyrchu difrifoldeb y sefyllfa bresennol, galwa'r Cyfarfod Cyffredinol ar i bobl Cymru i ymrwymo i atal talu'r drwydded deledu o'r 1af o fis Rhagfyr ymlaen oni gymerir camau cyn hynny i sicrhau fod annibyniaeth S4C yn cael ei sicrhau drwy ei ryddhau o gydreolaeth y BBC a hefyd bod cyllid digonol ar gyfer sicrhau ei dyfodol yn cael ei ei glustnodi.

**Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg**

**Ionawr, 2011**



**cymdeithas<sup>o</sup>**  
yr iaith  
gymraeg

# **S4C and the Future**

**Cymdeithas yr  
iaith's response to  
the Welsh Affairs  
Select Committee,  
S4C Inquiry**



**January 2011**

# Welsh Affairs Select Committee: S4C Inquiry

## Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg's Evidence

### 1. Introduction

1.1 S4C was established as a result of a long and popular campaign, and through political consensus. The fight to establish the Channel was long and costly: Cymdeithas yr Iaith and its supporters made the case in the first instance for a separate channel for Welsh language programmes, and then created a general consensus in Wales in support of its establishment. A number of our members were jailed for varying lengths of time, from a few days to 2 or 3 years; it was a costly campaign for many. The funding formula for S4C was placed in statute with that historical context in mind; it was done in order to ensure as far as possible that the way in which it is funded would not become subject to political interference.

1.2 Cymdeithas yr Iaith has published a booklet, S4C: Pwy dalodd amdani? ["Who paid for S4C?"] that traces the history of the popular campaign to establish the Channel in the first place. It can be read online:

<http://cymdeithas.org/pdf/s4c-pwy-dalodd-amdani.pdf>

1.3 S4C is a unique investment in the Welsh language, and is a cornerstone of Welsh language culture, playing a crucial role in the promotion of the Welsh language. According to the United Nations, the Welsh language continues to be a vulnerable language (UNESCO Atlas of the World's Languages in Danger 2009). Special steps are therefore needed to protect it for the future. The United Kingdom has also signed up to the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which notes under Article 11 that media provision should be made available in regional languages and that the independence and autonomy of the media should be respected.

1.4 There are now thousands of channels on our screens, and we need the security of seeing and hearing the Welsh language on S4C. One of the main reasons for the campaign in the 1970s was to ensure that the Welsh language extended to new media and so that it was not seen as an old-fashioned language. S4C has played a large part in the change of mindset that has been seen in Wales, and has given people a new confidence in the future of the Welsh language. Welsh-medium education is on the increase in Wales, and this needs the support of S4C with its programming for children from day one, starting with Cyw for the younger children and most recently replacing Planed Plant for older children with an enhanced service, Stwnsh.

1.5 We are concerned that the reduction in S4C's budget will affect programme quality. A fair amount of funding is required in order to maintain and develop the variety of programming that is available: drama such as Pen Talar and Teulu, live events such as the Eisteddfod and the Royal Welsh Show, and sport. Without adequate funding, the channel cannot compete with other mainstream channels in terms of quality and creativity. In cutting S4C's funding, the Government is not only affecting the service; but also striking a blow against the Welsh language, that will be in a more fragile state without a properly funded television service.

1.6 In a number of ways, the current UK Government's plans undermine the cross-party efforts made to give the Welsh language its proper place in the media. In the media in general, the Welsh language faces challenges, with the dramatic deterioration in Welsh language provision on commercial radio stations such as Heart FM and Radio Ceredigion.

1.7 We consider the cuts being made to S4C as a discrimination against a minority language group. We condemn the cuts in general, but the London Government must understand that the cuts to

S4C will have a direct effect on the Welsh language. S4C is a rare example of an economic investment made through the Welsh language. This has promoted the Welsh language in the areas where S4C invested. We believe the cuts will affect the Welsh language and have a knock-on damaging effect in Welsh language communities.

1.8 The other plans of the UK Government will affect the Welsh language, since the survival of the language depends on the communities where the language is spoken; the policy of encouraging people to move away from their communities to look for work will increase the migration of young people out of their communities, and will mean the Welsh language in those areas will suffer. It is vitally important therefore to protect this Welsh-language economic investment.

1.9 The presence of the Welsh language in the media is of vital importance to everyone in Wales. Cymdeithas yr Iaith believes that everyone in Wales, whether they speak Welsh or not, should have rights to the language. Not only rights to use it and to learn it, but also to hear it and see it. The presence of the Welsh language on television, radio, the web and every other possible medium, is therefore fundamental to our vision as an organisation. This vision is not limited to Cymdeithas yr Iaith. One of the main aims of the Welsh Language Commissioner, being established by the Government of Wales, will include the principle that people living in Wales should be able to live their lives through the medium of Welsh if they wish to do so. This aim reflects the ambition in Iaith Pawb [A National Action Plan for a Bilingual Wales, 2003] that everyone throughout Wales should be able to use the Welsh language in their social lives, in their leisure time and in their business activities.

## **2. No to cuts**

2.1 Cymdeithas yr Iaith is against the Government cuts in general: it is unjust that minorities, the poor, and people on the edge of society should pay for the mistakes of the financial sector and the governments that assisted them. Although it was a lack of regulation of the free market that caused the recession, the UK Government is, contrary to common sense, responding to the crisis by cutting back on protection for the weakest in society in the face of capitalist forces.

2.2 As the Culture Minister of the Catalan Government said whilst giving evidence to the National Assembly for Wales recently:

*“...linguistic liberalism, like economic liberalism, is not neutral. . .when two languages coexist in one land, protective public action is required with respect to the weaker one. Otherwise, it will be fated, first of all, to marginalisation and, in the long term, to extinction.”*

2.3. One of the reasons for the establishment of S4C in the first places was market failure. Before our only Welsh language channel came into being, Welsh language programming had to compete with English language programming for funding and for airtime. One of the many problems with the UK Government-BBC's joint plan is that it will recreate that old competition between Welsh language programming and English language programming. This will create a tension between the two languages, going against the message of bilingualism on an equal footing which has developed over recent years. It would, therefore, be a big step backwards.

2.4 The Government's plan to cut the Channel's budget by 24.4%, or 42.5% in real terms (source: BECTU) is a cut that could, according to S4C, endanger the existence of the channel. In addition to those cuts, however, the Government intends to give the BBC partial responsibility for funding and managing the Channel.

2.5 Some argue that S4C's independence could be guaranteed within a jointly managed system within the BBC. We disagree. It is clear to us that the UK Government-BBC plan has several weaknesses, not least due to the position of English-medium broadcasting in Wales. For years, the Welsh output of the BBC has been cut, with fewer programmes reflecting life in Wales on television. If we cannot depend on the BBC to protect Wales-related programmes in English, why would they protect Welsh language programmes? Broadcasting in Wales is already in crisis; the proposed plans will kill any hope of plurality in the media in Wales.

2.6 The channel was established after the 1979 election, a commitment having been made in the manifestos of all four main parties in Wales. There was no mention in the manifesto of any party, before the 2010 election, of any plans to drastically cut the budget of the channel, to establish joint management under the BBC Trust, or an act of parliament that would allow the Secretary of State to abolish the Channel completely.

### **3. A New S4C**

3.1 We recognise that there are weaknesses in the current model and management of S4C. We are therefore calling for a new S4C to be established, a devolved, multi-media broadcaster/publisher for Wales.

3.2 We are calling for a new S4C based on the following principles:

- **FINANCIAL SECURITY** - A television channel cannot be run without having the certainty of adequate funding. The current agreement gives S4C certainty about its funding up until 2015. We believe that a funding formula is needed for S4C that will give it long term stability to do its work confidently.
- **INDEPENDENCE** - The independence of Welsh language public media services is essential in order to ensure democratic and media plurality. The S4C Authority and S4C must be independent of the BBC and others, editorially, operationally and creatively.
- **DEVOLUTION** - It is paramount, in order to ensure that the expertise and ability to make the right decisions about the future of broadcasting is in Wales, that media functions are devolved to the National Assembly for Wales.
- **A FEDERAL BBC** - It is essential that devolution also happens within the BBC. A federalised BBC would be the best choice, in order to ensure fairness and balance.
- **QUALITY** - Welsh language media of the same quality as English language media is essential to the continued existence of the Welsh language.
- **DIGITAL** - The creation of a varied media ecosystem in Welsh is essential to the future of the Welsh language. A substantial investment in digital media is crucial in order to ensure that the Welsh language is used in all spheres.
- **COLLABORATION** - Collaboration between media institutions and beyond is important in order to enable our media to be as strong as possible. However, this should be collaboration that does not endanger the independence of the Welsh language provider.
- **DEVOLUTION OF THE CHANNEL THROUGHOUT WALES** - We believe that S4C's current headquarters in Llanisien in Cardiff is unsuitable for the media in Wales and that different parts of the process of running a Welsh language public media service should be devolved to different areas.

3.3 We are of the view that a thorough review of the commissioning structure, the strategy and role of the S4C Authority is needed, including alternative models for the S4C Authority and the administration of expenditure on Welsh language media. We recognise that there has been a lack

of accountability between S4C and its audience during the last few years, but this will not be rectified through a partnership with the BBC.

3.4 We are eager to see S4C extending its remit to include digital media, so that it becomes a media publisher rather than being limited to being a television channel only. We believe that the Welsh language needs to be promoted as a medium in these areas, as noted in the last report by the Council of Europe's Committee of Experts on the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages when it considered Welsh language media provision. Consideration should be given to changing the relationship of the Authority / Channel to one that could give the S4C Authority the flexibility to extend its remit to include digital media.

3.5 A significant percentage of the S4C Authority's funding formula should be earmarked for investment in digital media in order to build the audience of the future, ensuring that linear television remains strong. A director of digital content should be appointed to develop this.

3.6 We believe that consideration should be given to sharing S4C's responsibilities between three bases across Wales, administering departments in various locations rather than spreading jobs too thinly. It would be useful if the central administration of S4C was closer to the independent companies that are commissioned to create programmes for them.

#### **4. The Public Bodies Bill**

4.1 We agree with a number of comments made recently in the House of Lords regarding the Public Bodies Bill, and we agree with the amendments put forward by Roger Roberts, that would exclude S4C from the Measure.

4.2 The Measure attempts to treat S4C in the same way as any another Government department. Treating Welsh language broadcasting in that way is a major legal, financial and historical error.

4.3 It is inappropriate to attempt to push plans to reform S4C through the Public Bodies Bill; it ignores the way the channel was established.

4.4. Firstly, a Secretary of State should not be able to decide, via secondary legislation, on the structure, the budget and the whole existence of a channel established through statute for extremely important social and cultural reasons.

4.5 We agree with the conclusions of the House of Lords Constitutional Committee, that strongly criticised the concept of abolishing organisations through secondary legislation.

4.6 Secondly, we believe the idea that Government on its own can decide the budget of a public television channel on an annual basis sets a very dangerous precedent. Such a decision would raise serious questions about the broadcaster's political independence.

4.7 Thirdly, we fail to understand why the Government has decided to amend the budget of the channel, create a partnership between S4C and the BBC, and at the same time, include the channel in Schedule 7 of the Public Bodies Bill. This would allow the Secretary of State to charge a fee for S4C's services, privatise the service, or even abolish it completely.

4.8 Would it not be better to consider the future and independence of S4C in the next broadcasting act within the next few years? Since so many matters need to be considered, such

as the independence of the channel as well as wider considerations such as the effect on the Welsh language and plurality in the media in Wales, it would be wiser to consider the future of S4C within a timetable that allows people in Wales to give input into the future of the channel, rather than its future being steered by rash decisions by Government Ministers and BBC Chiefs.

## **5. Joint Management by the BBC**

5.1 The decision to move S4C's budget and part of its management to the BBC also undermines the Channel's independence, and is ultimately a further threat to the funding levels for Welsh language programming and content. We are concerned that we would return to the position before the establishment of S4C, where Welsh language programmes would have to compete for funding with English language programming. We are also concerned that S4C would not have the independence to make the best decisions for the Welsh language channel. There would also be clashes of interest, especially where S4C is producing Welsh language content that could be similar to English language content. S4C is competing with the BBC for audiences and talent in some cases - who would have the last word in such cases if S4C did not have the independence to make decisions without the approval of the BBC? It would be wholly unacceptable for S4C's executive board to be a combination of the S4C Authority and the BBC. The BBC would not on any account accept Government representatives on the BBC Trust, so it is unfair to ask S4C to be controlled in such a way by the BBC.

5.2 The lack of independence guaranteed by the Government's plans is clear from Michael Lyons' letter to the S4C Authority. The letter says "The BBC Trust is the guardian of the licence fee and as a result will need to have oversight of how this money is being spent". In other words, the BBC at a British level would decide how much money would be spent, how it would be spent, and who would spend money on Welsh language programming.

5.3 We agree with the comments made by Elystan Morgan (9 November 2010 : Column 140-1, Hansard):

*“A legislative framework was set up that guaranteed funds for [S4C] that would be adequate for it to carry out its commission. Indeed, its independence was guaranteed by statute. The viability of that channel is now challenged and jeopardised by the fact that that financial guarantee disappears. The independence is jeopardised by the fact that it is contemplated that it should be merged with the BBC as a very junior, meagre partner. Its independence cannot possibly be real in those circumstances; indeed, the major decisions may well be taken by the broadcasting trust in London. I do not believe that I overstate for a moment the anxieties that are felt in Wales concerning that loss of independence. ... The continued viability and independence of S4C is crucial to the very existence of the Welsh language. The Welsh language is spoken by some 580,000 persons, including three or four of us in this House. It is one of the oldest living languages in Europe-it stems back to its Indo-European origins about 1,500 years ago. It was a living language 1,000 years ago, when French was only a patois of Latin. In those circumstances, I ask the House to consider that it is part of its trust in relation to the Welsh language to regard the situation of S4C as being wholly unique. Parliament has the sovereignty to amend all the legislative structures but, in so doing, it would be reneging on the solemn compact that was made between a very honourable gentleman and the people of Wales 28 years ago.”*

5.4 To ensure the best possible future, and the fairest future, for the Welsh language channel, we call upon the Government to ensure the following:

- Complete management independence and editorial independence for S4C without any interference by the BBC or the Government;
- An independent funding formula for the Welsh language Channel, based on inflation.

## **6. Closing remarks**

6.1 The Welsh language channel is treasured by people in Wales, because it is a medium that brings the Welsh language alive to those who speak Welsh, to those who do not, to Welsh learners, to babies, children, young people and older people in all parts of Wales. The Welsh language belongs to everyone in Wales, whether they speak the language or not. S4C's purpose is to provide Welsh language programming. That is why it was established after years of protest and campaigning, the only channel to be created as a result of such a mass campaign.

6.2 In Wales, we live our lives through the medium of two languages. A television service in Welsh and in English is needed to reflect that. Securing English language television based in Wales for Wales does not depend on sacrificing the Welsh language channel, as some have argued. It is the duty of Members of Parliament representing Wales to ensure a fair broadcasting settlement for everyone living in Wales.

6.3 It is essential that S4C has an adequate funding formula, and that it can remain separate from the BBC. The Conservative and Liberal Democrat Government are demonstrating a lack of respect towards the people of Wales, in the field of broadcasting specifically, and has undermined devolution. Plurality in the media is necessary, and Wales deserves a proper English language and a proper Welsh language media speaking to the whole of Wales.

## **Appendix:**

1. Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg, S4C: Pwy Dalodd Amdani? [Who paid for S4C?] (First impression: 1985, Second impression: 2010): <http://cymdeithas.org/pdf/s4c-pwy-dalodd-amdani.pdf>

2. S4C Emergency Motion - Passed at the AGM of Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg October 2010

The General Meeting notes the following:

- S4C was established following a long and popular campaign and through political consensus.
- S4C's funding formula was laid down in statute in order to ensure no political interference in the way it is funded.
- The level of funding for S4C reflects the need to ensure that the Welsh language service is equal to other mainstream services on other channels in terms of quality and creativity.
- S4C is unique, is a cornerstone of Welsh language culture, and is consequently a service that cannot be treated in the same way as government 'departments'.
- The power to determine the nature of the media continues to lie with the UK Government and the BBC.

The General Meeting believes:

- It is essential, in order to ensure that the expertise and ability to make the right decisions for the future of broadcasting in Wales, that law-making powers over the media will be transferred to the National Assembly for Wales.

- It is essential that devolution of power also takes place within the BBC, with a federal system as the best choice to ensure fairness and balance
- Welsh language media of equivalent standard to the media provided in the English language is essential to the survival of the Welsh language
- The creation of a diverse media ecosystem is essential to the future of the Welsh language. A substantial investment in digital media is crucial in order to ensure that the Welsh is a language used naturally in all media.
- Collaboration between media organisations and others is essential to allow our media to be as strong as possible.
- The independence of Welsh language public service media is essential to ensure media pluralism and democracy. S4C's functions should not under any condition come under the auspices of the BBC.
- We believe that S4C's current headquarters in Llanishen is unsuitable for the media in Wales and that different parts of the process of running the Welsh language public service media should be devolved.

The General Meeting calls for:

- The devolution of power over broadcasting in Wales to the National Assembly for Wales.
- A thorough review of the commissioning structure, strategy and role of the S4C Authority, including alternative models for an S4C Authority and the administration of funding on Welsh language media.
- A consideration of the need to change the relationship of the Authority / the Channel to one that could give flexibility to the S4C Authority to extend its remit to include digital media content and other media beyond television.
- A significant percentage of the S4C Authority's funding to be invested in digital media in order to build the future audience, ensuring that linear television remains strong. A director of digital should be appointed to develop this.
- A fair funding formula for S4C that will provide security for its long term future and ensure that it is a body beyond the reach of political interference
- The devolution of S4C's work between three centres across Wales, running different departments in different areas rather than spreading jobs thinly.

Furthermore, the General Meeting calls on:

- Members of Parliament – and in particular Wales MPs – to vote against the clauses in the Public Bodies Bill that will allow the government to put its proposed changes in place.
- members and supporters of Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg to take urgent action to put pressure on their local MPs to this effect
- the new Web Campaign Organiser to develop a prominent section on the Cymdeithas website to promote and facilitate such a lobbying campaign.

Finally, in order to reflect the seriousness of the current situation, the General Meeting calls on the people of Wales to commit to refrain from paying the license fee from 1st December onwards unless action is taken before then to ensure that independence is obtained for S4C, by relieving it of shared management by the BBC and also that that sufficient funding to secure its future is allocated.

**Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg**  
**January 2011**